

CITY OF ESCONDIDO
MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

April 1, 2014

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Vice-chairman Rea, in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Commissioner Lee, Commissioner Rea, Commissioner Cherry, Commissioner Breitenfeld, Commissioner O'Boyle, and Commissioner Spann,

Commissioners absent: Commissioner James.

Staff present: Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

Commissioner O'Boyle introduced herself to the Commission.

Taken out of order.

MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve the minutes of the February 4, 2014 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

Selection of Chair and Vice-chair and determination of seating

CHAIR NOMINATION:

Commissioner Brietenfeld nominated Commissioner Cherry for Chair. Commissioner Lee seconded the nomination. Motion carried unanimously.

VICE-CHAIR NOMINATION:

Commissioner Spann nominated Commissioner Rea for Vice-chair. Chairman Lee seconded the nomination.

Commissioner Rea nominated Commissioner O'Boyle for Vice-chair. Commissioner Brietenfeld seconded the motion.

ACTION ON COMMISSIONER REA NOMINATION:

Ayes: Lee, Spann, Cherry, and O'Boyle. Noes: Rea, and Brietenfeld. Motion carried. (4-2)

ACTION ON COMMISSIONER O'BOYLE NOMINATION:

Ayes: Rea, and Brietenfeld. Noes: Lee, Spann, Cherry, and O'Boyle. Motion did not carry. (2-4)

Vice-chairman Rea requested to be seated closest to the Minutes Clerk. Chairman Cherry was to move to the center chair position.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: None.

CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. Review proposed facade changes in Historic Downtown at 212 E. Grand Avenue.

Mr. Bingham provided the background history for the property located at 212 East Grand Avenue as well as the current status of the property. He noted that the applicant's request was to establish a restaurant, recess the front windows and door to create an area for outdoor dining with beer and wine, and to add some design elements on the rear of the building. Staff recommended approval.

Commissioner O'Boyle requested clarification regarding what type of floor material would be used for the entrance. Mr. Hedyati indicated that they planned on removing the existing tile and polishing the floor concrete.

Vice-chairman Rea suggested that if brick was discovered during the renovation that it be incorporated into the project. Mr. Hedyati concurred, noting he was not aware of the material that was underneath the stucco.

Discussion ensued regarding a clarification of the plane for the doors and windows and as well as what type of railings would be used.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Breitenfeld, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously.

2. Review proposed room addition behind existing single-family OEN residence at 755 Chestnut.

Mr. Bingham provided the background history for the property and noted the property was not on the Local Register or survey. He then provided a description of the one-story family room expansion and noted that it would not be visible from Chestnut Street. Staff recommended approval.

Chairman Cherry and staff discussed the proposed path of travel to the garage.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Rea, seconded by Commissioner Spann, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously.

3. **Review proposed additions to single-family OEN residence at 332 E. 10th Avenue.**

Mr. Bingham provided the background history for the property located at 332 E. 10th Avenue and noted that the house was not on the survey or Local Register. He indicated that the present owner wanted to renovate the residence as well as convert the single-bay garage into a master bedroom, construct two additional bedrooms in the current porch location at the back and add a double carport off the alley. He indicated that owner had expressed an interest in selling the property. Staff recommended approval of the most recent revised plans and color and material exhibits as presented, with the condition that the garage door and driveway be removed to meet current Code regulations regarding legally converted garages.

Discussion ensued regarding a clarification of the proposed colors and roofing material.

Mr. Bingham noted that the replacement windows would be wooden.

Commissioner Spann suggested that the landscaping proposed for the driveway area be consistent with the other landscape. Mr. Hawes replied in the affirmative.

Chairman Cherry asked if removal of the driveway apron would require removal of the curb. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative, noting it did not have one currently.

Chairman Cherry requested clarification regarding what type of material would be used for the carport as well as what type of pitch it would have. Mr. Hawes and Mr. Marquez noted that the materials would be the same as the house along with having a gable pitch.

Chairman Cherry asked whether they felt the proposed carport's posts would provide adequate alley access. Mr. Hawes replied in the affirmative.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Rea, to approve staff's recommendation with the removal of the existing garage door and driveway. Motion carried. Ayes: Spann, Rea, O'Boyle, Lee, and Brietenfeld. Noes: Cherry. (5-1)

4. Review Code Enforcement case for vinyl window installation in OEN at 610 S. Hickory.

Mr. Bingham provided the background history for the property located at 610 South Hickory and noted that this was a Code Enforcement case due to the property owner not obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacing the aluminum windows with vinyl windows. He also stated that the property was not on the Local Register or survey and was built in 1967.

Chairman Cherry asked if a building permit was needed for vinyl windows. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative. He also stated that the only reason for the code enforcement issue was due to the property being in the Historic District.

Commissioner Brietenfeld noted that the adjacent property had vinyl windows.

David Ogden, Clear Energy, noted that he replaced the windows and was not aware of the conditions for this Historic District.

Commissioner Rea stated that she was very disappointed with the look of the vinyl windows, noting they did not resemble what originally existed.

Commissioner Brietenfeld did not feel the look of the windows was detrimental to the look of the residence.

Mr. Ogden stated that the replacement windows were used more for function than form, noting they helped insulate the house. He also indicated that the vinyl could be painted.

Commissioner O'Boyle noted that she was opposed to vinyl windows, noting her preference would have been to use a wooden trim. Mr. Ogden noted that wooden trim could be used.

Commissioner Spann felt the vinyl windows were appropriate in this location since the house was not a significant historic home. He expressed his concern with the Certificate of Appropriateness not being obtained and felt that the cost for the certificate should be received. Mr. Bingham noted that the applicant was paying for this hearing and the Certificate of Appropriateness if approved.

Discussion ensued regarding painting the window trim or part of the vinyl window frame the same color as the existing house panels.

Commissioner O'Boyle motioned to add wood trim for all windows and that it be painted the color of the house trim. The motion included painting the vinyl window frames bronze. Motion did not carry.

Commissioner Lee noted that the Secretary of Interior Standards needed to be considered, noting the property was neither on the Local Register nor Survey as well as being under 50 years old. He also noted that the subject windows were energy efficient.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Brietenfeld, to approve as submitted. Motion did not carry. Ayes: Spann, Brietenfeld, and Lee. Noes: Cherry, Rea, and O'Boyle. (3-3)

Commissioner Lee noted that the level of significance needed to be taken into consideration according the Secretary of Interior Standards.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Rea, seconded by Commissioner O'Boyle, to add one-by-four molding to match the existing shape of the original trim and to place over the vinyl edge flange which was to be painted the color of the siding or dark green trim color. Motion carried. Ayes: Rea, O'Boyle, Brietenfeld, and Cherry. Noes: Lee and Spann. (4-2)

5. Review proposed additions to single-family OEN residence at 137 E. 11th Avenue.

Mr. Bingham provided the background history for the property located at 137 East 11th Avenue and noted it was neither on the Local Register nor Survey. He indicated that the property was challenging due to the topography having varying elevations. The request included retaining the 520 SF residence, expanding behind the existing residence, and constructing a garage with a double gable roof at the corner of the residence. He stated that wood framed double-hung windows would be used for the addition. Staff felt the proposed plan was the best option, given the property's elevations, and outcroppings of boulders. Staff recommended approval.

Commissioner O'Boyle asked if the garage doors would be wooden or metal.

Abrhil Arvizu, applicant, stated that she was not sure what material the garage doors would be. She stated that she wanted to keep the original design in a craftsman style.

Commissioner Rea felt the addition of the garage and doors should be simplified down to resemble the simplicity of the original cottage (a California bungalow). She suggested using single hung windows. She felt the design of the garage was out of character with house. She also suggested flipping the gables on the garage and adding a front door with a single pane window.

Ms. Arvizu noted no problem with making the garage doors and front door more simple.

Commissioner Brietenfeld reference Item 4 on the south elevation design, feeling it would be appropriate for the design of the garage. Ms. Arvizu noted no issue with a simplifying the garage door and front door.

Chairman Cherry was in favor of the proposed color pallet as well as the suggestion to simplify the front door and garage door.

Commissioner Rea suggested a single gable for the garage.

Commissioner Brietenfeld felt a single gable would create the appearance of a larger garage. Commissioner Spann concurred.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Rea, seconded by Commissioner O'Boyle, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included simplifying the front door by using a single window and single wood panel and simplifying the garage door by reducing the amount of panels. Motion carried unanimously.

6. Review proposed shed behind existing single-family OEN residence at 1165 Chestnut.

Mr. Bingham provided the background history, which included additions and revisions for the property located 1165 Chestnut. He noted that the property was on the Survey. The request was to construct a shed with a gable roof and demolish the carport and construct a new double garage with a bedroom and bath above the garage. Staff recommended approval with a condition to deed restrict the bedroom above the garage so it could not be used as a second dwelling unit.

Samuel Mireles, applicant, noted that that the garage unit would not be used as a rental. He also stated that he planned on renovating the property in phases.

Commissioner O'Boyle asked if a kitchen would be allowed in the unit above the garage. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative.

Commissioner Spann noted that the additions would not be visible from the street. He felt the garage structure needed a little more architectural detail. Mr. Mireles noted that he could increase the size of the front facing window, which would help provide more design.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Rea, seconded by Commissioner Spann, to approve staff's recommendation. Ayes: Spann, Rea, Lee, and O'Boyle. Noes: Brienfeld and Cherry. Motion carried. (4-2)

7. Review proposal to demolish a single-family OEN residence and build a new house at 220 W. 10th Avenue.

Mr. Bingham provided the background history for the property located 220 West 10th Avenue. He noted that the property was not on the Local Register but was on the survey. He indicated that staff had researched whether there was any significance to the property and found none, noting that the historian indicated that there were many additions to the property. Mr. Bingham noted that the walls

of the house were built with a fired clay block with no reinforcement and little footing, so they were crumbling. Code Enforcement had posted the structure as uninhabitable. The first request was to demolish the residence, which staff supported. The second request was to build a new house, retaining the garage, and adding a single carport. Staff did not feel the proposed Spanish hacienda architecture was appropriate for the location and felt the treatments should be more in line with the simpler architecture of the Mediterranean Revival it was replacing.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Commissioner Rea, to approve staff's recommendation that the structure located at 220 West 10th Avenue be allowed to be demolished. Motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner Rea felt the new structure should resemble the original structure, a simple Mediterranean style, to maintain the diverse fabric of the Old Escondido Neighborhood. She also felt the proposed design was too elaborate.

Mr. Yant noted that the owner would be totally fine with simplifying the architecture. He asked if he could submit another design before the next regularly scheduled Commission meeting, which could be acted upon.

Commissioner Lee felt the structure should be consistent with the other residences in the area.

Commissioner O'Boyle felt the new structure should resemble the previous structure.

Commissioner Spann felt the structure should represent a Mediterranean Revival style like the Ben Cueva units on West 7th Avenue.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Rea, seconded by Commissioner Brietenfeld, to direct staff to work with the applicant to revise the house design to resemble a Mediterranean revival/Spanish style. This was to be submitted to the subcommittee comprised of Commissioners Rea, O'Boyle, and Brietenfeld for approval. Motion carried unanimously.

Updates:

Historic District - Breitenfeld, Rea
History Center – Lee
Commercial Historical – Spann, Cherry
Register/Survey/CLG Grants – Breitenfeld, Cherry (McQuead – alternate)
Mills Act Monitoring Committee – Breitenfeld, Rea, and Spann
Historic Public Relations – Rea, (vacancy)
Endangered Structures/Vintage Signs – Rea, Cherry
Daley Ranch – Staff

Chairman Cherry requested an agenda item to discuss reviewing subcommittees with regard to establishing goals and creating and replacing some subcommittees. The Commission tabled updates to the next meeting.

Nominations for Historic Awards Program: Confirmation of five (5) vintage signs nominated for awards to be presented May 21, 2014 and wording of award certificates.

Mrs. Cherry referenced the staff report and noted that staff requested language for each certificate. Commissioner Rea provided wording for staff, which was reviewed and edited.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Commissioner Rea asked for an update regarding the City Council status for preservations fees. Mrs. Cherry noted staff had not heard anything yet.

Chairman Cherry noted that she was looking forward to the dialog regarding the fees. Commissioner Rea suggested sending a new letter to City Council asking for an agenda item to discuss the fees. Chairman Cherry suggested looking at this at the next meeting when considering the subcommittees.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS:

1. Memo regarding Item 1, Current Business
2. Memo regarding Vintage Signs nominated for awards, Item K

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 5:28 pm. The next regular meeting was scheduled for June 3, 2014, at 3:30 p.m.



Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner



Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk