

CITY OF ESCONDIDO

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

August 5, 2014

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:07 p.m. by Vice-chair Rea, in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Commissioner Lee, Commissioner Rea, Commissioner Breitenfeld, Commissioner O'Boyle, and Commissioner Spann.

Commissioners absent: Commissioner Danskin.

Staff present: Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Brietenfeld, to approve the minutes of the June 3, 2014 meeting. Motion carried 4-0-1, Commissioner Lee abstaining.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: Received.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

1. LOCAL REGISTER/MILLS ACT – CASE NO. HP 14-0002

REQUEST: Local Register Listing & Mills Act contract for Ralph Haver house (built in 1978) in the OEN

LOCATION: 831 S. Broadway

Recommendation: Approval

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and noted staff recommended the Commission forward recommendations of approval to City

Council for the Local Register listing, Mills Act contract request, and CEQA exemption for the property located at 831 South Broadway.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

2. MILLS ACT – CASE NO. HP 14-0001:

REQUEST: Mills Act contract for Local Register property in the OEN

LOCATION: 538 East 9th Avenue

Recommendation: Approval

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and noted staff recommended the Commission forward recommendations of approval to City Council for the Mills Act contract request, and CEQA exemption for the property located at 538 East Ninth Avenue.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. ADM 14-0126:

REQUEST: Approval of enclosed patio in the OEN built many years ago without permits.

LOCATION: 119 West 7th Avenue.

Recommendation: Conditional Approval

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and provided a brief background history for the subject property. He noted that this was not a code enforcement case, noting that the applicant came to the City asking what the approval process would consist of. Mr. Bingham indicated that the enclosed

room was used as a family room and that it was not visible from the street. Staff recommended approval with the condition that the wall of the family room be modified to meet the sideyard setback.

Commissioner Spann asked if the posts depicted in the picture were made out of block.

Carlos Bishop, Designer, replied in the affirmative and noted that there were wood frames between the pillars.

Commissioner O'Boyle stated that she was impressed that the owners came to the City to legalize this instead of being forced by Code Enforcement action.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner O'Boyle, seconded by Vice-chair Rea, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

2. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. ADM 14-0048:

REQUEST: Consideration of revised design for replacement home in the OEN.

LOCATION: 220 West 10th Avenue.

Recommendation: Approval.

Paul Bingham, Associated Planner, referenced the revised design and noted that staff recommended approval of the revised design.

Vice-chair Rea expressed concern with the proposed gate being excessive for the lot. She also felt the proposed residence should be located in the middle of the lot, which would be similar to the previous residence.

Commissioner Spann questioned whether the gate would fit on the lot as proposed. He asked if approving the subject request included approving the details outlined in the drawing. Mrs. Cherry noted that staff would ensure that the detail was included in the final plans.

Vice-chair Rea moved to approve staff's recommendation as presented with a modification that the residence be located more in the center of the property.

Commissioner Lee was in favor of the proposed location for the residence due to feeling it would provide for more useable yard.

Commissioner O'Boyle suggested revising the motion to approve staff's recommendation with direction to narrow the gate so as not to accommodate a vehicle.

Commissioner Spann suggested approving staff's recommendation and letting staff work with the applicant to incorporate the Commission's recommendations.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Rea, seconded by Commissioner Spann, to revise the previous motion by approving staff's recommendation with the intent being for staff to work with the applicant regarding the gate and ensuring the detail was incorporated into the residence. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

3. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. PHG 14-0020:

REQUEST: Receive input regarding proposal to demolish some adobe structures on the Weir Brothers site and incorporate others into a 64-unit affordable apartment complex.

LOCATION: 1556 South Escondido Boulevard

Jay Paul, Associated Planner, referenced the staff report and noted that staff recommended the Commission review the proposal and provide comment/recommendations regarding the appropriateness of the proposed demolition of the existing adobe structures on the site and preservation and integration of the adobe office into the project design.

Kent Trimble, representing Veterans Village of San Diego, provided the background history for the subject property. He noted that the property was being used as a drug and alcoholic treatment center for honorably discharged Veterans. He stated that proposed project would transition the 44 units of transitional housing into 64 permanent supportive housing 1- to 3- bedroom units. He then provided an overview of the site plans.

Commissioner O'Boyle asked Mr. Trimble if they owned the two adjacent lots to the south. Mr. Trimble replied in the negative.

Commissioner O'Boyle referenced the property on Escondido Boulevard whereby a garage with a bronze statue was situated, feeling this might be a more appropriate location for this project.

local and the Weir brothers were local, and adobe was good for the environment. She expressed her concern with the consultant's reports stating that due diligence was preformed, noting her view that the property would probably meet the criteria for local, State, and National registers. She stated that she supported providing for the homeless and the Veterans but was opposed to impacting the historical significance this property.

Commissioner Spann noted that subject adobe units were significantly unique and should be retained. Commissioner Lee concurred.

Commissioner Brietenfeld was opposed to impacting the historical significance of the subject adobe structures.

Vice-chairman Rea asked Mr. Trimble if any historic research had occurred regarding the subject property. Mr. Trimble stated that approximately six years ago they had approached the City to improve the adobe units behind the front unit and were told the units were not historic. He noted that this was the first time they had conducted a cultural resource study. He also explained that they were a non-profit social service provider who had contracts with the VA.

Commissioner Brietenfeld asked Mr. Trimble if they were able to sell the subject property. Mr. Trimble explained that the funds used to purchase the property came from the VA and HUD, and as such, upon sale of the property 70% of the funds would have to be returned to the VA and HUD.

Commissioner O'Boyle asked if the subject facility would provide for families, noting her view that it did not have enough space for a tot lot. Mr. Trimble replied in the affirmative.

Vice-Chair Rea stated that the subject property was a culturally significant unique adobe complex, noting she was unaware of any others like it. She was opposed to proposed design. She stated that she was in favor of providing for the Veterans but also respected the City's cultural heritage, which the subject property was a significant part of.

Vice-chair Rea and Mr. Trimble discussed the funding mechanisms for the proposed project.

Commissioner Spann stated that the subject property was the most unique adobe complex in the City and demolishing it was unacceptable.

Mr. Trimble questioned whether constructing on the community garden and only removing Units 7-10 would be acceptable, thereby retaining the circular apartments and front office.

Vice-chair Rea stated that this would be more acceptable. She suggested incorporating the adobe aspect into the new design.

Mr. Trimble stated that studies conducted by the VA had indicated that a new, modern, clean design was the best therapeutic situation for homeless or low-income veterans.

Commissioner O'Boyle expressed her sympathy for the veterans, noting her view that the adobe units should be preserved. Vice-chairman Rea concurred.

Wendy Barker, Escondido, History Center Director, felt the property should be preserved.

Commissioner Spann stated that his preference would be to preserve the property, as it existed or at least to retain the front office and the adobe structures in the round circle, which should be placed on the Local Register.

Vice-Chair Rea referenced two written communications from individuals who were opposed to demolishing the adobe structures.

Commissioner Lee stated he could accept removing units 7-10 and incorporating a new design into the community garden but retaining the front office and circle apartments.

4. DISCUSS HPC GOALS AND WORK GROUPS:

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, referenced the staff report and requested input.

Vice-chair Rea asked if ad hoc meetings would have to be noticed. Mrs. Cherry replied in the negative.

Discussion ensued regarding a clarification of the protocol for creating ad hoc workgroups.

Mills Act Discussion:

Vice-chair Rea asked if Mills Act visits could occur without going inside. Mrs. Cherry noted staff could research this further and report back to the Commission.

Commissioner O'Boyle stated that she was unaware of any jurisdiction that required going inside a Mills Act property.

Discussion ensued regarding the protocol for Mills Act inspections.

Mr. Bingham noted that Item 3 in the Mills Act contract had language whereby the owners agree to periodic examinations for both the interior and exterior of their structures. Commissioner O'Boyle asked for staff to provide the Secretary of Interior Standards language for local and State designations. Mrs. Cherry noted that anything requiring a building permit would provide for inspecting the work.

Vice-chair Rea suggested creating a Mills Act ad hoc workgroup with the goal of the group being to create the protocol for Mills Act visits and to have a list of homes to inspect. The workgroup was comprised of Commissioners Rea, O'Boyle, and Spann.

Staff was to arrange a meeting with Code Enforcement for the Mills Act Workgroup.

Grants & Funding:

Commissioner O'Boyle noted that she could not begin working on this until the new guidelines were available. The workgroup was comprised of Commissioners Lee, and O'Boyle.

Promote Cultural Assets:

Discussion ensued regarding writing articles for local magazines and promoting HPC awards in May. This item was deferred until fall or as opportunities came about. The workgroup was comprised of Vice-chair Rea.

Identify Emerging Historic Districts:

Commissioner Brietenfeld suggested this category be used as identifying different historic periods for structures within the City. The workgroup was comprised of Commissioners Brietenfeld and O'Boyle.

5. DISCUSSION OF FEES RELATED TO HISTORIC DISTRICTS AND PROPERTIES

Vice-chair Rea provided the update and noted that City Council had not responded to the letter from the Commission regarding fees. She asked if the Commission wanted to write another letter to City Council.

Mrs. Cherry suggested the Commission establish a workgroup to gather information on fees that could be presented to City Council.

Vice-chair Rae felt that the Old Escondido Neighborhood was doing a good job spreading the word about items where a Certificate of Appropriateness was needed.

Vice-chair Rea asked how long a Certificate of Appropriateness was good for. Mr. Bingham noted that there was no expiration date for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Vice-chair Rea asked staff to research whether incentive funds were available. She also expressed her concern with the fees being charged for the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Spann asked if staff could check into the status of the façade improvement program.

The Commission established a future workgroup to look at fees. The workgroup was comprised of Vice-chair Rea and Commissioner Spann.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Vice-Chair Rea stated that she would like to be able to contact entities dealing with historic items in Escondido, which could be forwarded to the Commission.

Mrs. Cherry noted that this part of the agenda was where commissioners could provide comments, noting no action could be taken on the comments.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 5:13 pm. The next regular meeting was scheduled for October 7, 2014, at 3:30 p.m.



Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner



Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk