CITY OF ESCONDIDO

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

February 3, 2015

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:05 p.m. by Vice-chair Rea, in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Commissioner Taylor, Commissioner O'Boyle, Commissioner Spann, Vice-chair Rea, Commissioner Lee, Commissioner Brietenfeld, and Commissioner Danskin.

Commissioners absent: None.

Staff present: Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Brietenfeld, to approve the minutes of the December 2, 2014 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

ELECTION OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Commissioner Spann was nominated for Chair by Commissioner Danskin.

Vice-chair Rea was nominated for Chair by Commissioner O'Boyle.

Vote Results: Vice-Chair Rea was elected to Chair with a 4-3 vote. Ayes: Spann, Taylor, O'Boyle, and Brietenfeld.

Commissioner Spann was nominated and elected to Vice-chair with a unanimous vote.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: Received. Commissioners Danskin, Lee, Breitenfeld and Rea all expressed interest in the March webinar by the CA Preservation Foundation.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. **DESIGN REVIEW: Renovations at Property in OEN – Case No. ADM 15-0010**

Request: Approval of 432 SF room and 35 SF patio additions at the rear of an existing 1950's residence.

Location: 150 East 9th Avenue

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, provided the report and noted that the subject property was not on the Local Register or any historic survey. She indicated that this item was before the Commission due to the property being located in the OEN. She provided an overview of the property and noted that the request was to add two bedrooms, a bath, and a patio to the existing residence. She then provided an overview of the proposed materials and noted staff had no issues with the request and recommended approval as proposed.

Chair Rea noted that the area where the addition was occurring was not visible from the street.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Danskin, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously.

2. **DESIGN REVIEW: Additional work for previously reviewed OEN 1890 Italianate Brick Cottage – Case No. ADM 14-0199:**

REQUEST: Approval to remove middle windows and basement windows and replace door in historic rear addition.

Location: 637 South Juniper Street

Chair Rea and Commissioner Taylor recused themselves from this item.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided the background history for this item. He stated that the building department had issued a stop work order on the work being performed at the subject property. He indicated that the issues needing discussion were the appropriateness of removing windows on the north, south and west side of the addition for the purpose of providing structural integrity, and the appropriateness of installing a double French door on the south side of the addition. Mr. Bingham then provided illustrations of the proposed work and materials for the project. Staff recommended approval as proposed.

Commissioner Danskin asked if the proposed work could be seen from the street. Mr. Bingham replied in the affirmative.

Concerning the upper story, Commissioner Danskin asked Mr. Conte what he would prefer be installed with regard to the windows currently needing structural integrity. Mr. Conte indicated that he was not replacing the windows, but will use the existing historic wood windows. While working, he discovered that there were no structural members between any of the three triple window groupings. He indicated that the engineer recommended removing the entire group of windows on the west elevation and the middle window in the north and south elevations, and adding framing to provide structural integrity. He also stated that he was in the process of resolving some foundation and roof framing issues.

Commissioner Danskin asked Mr. Conte if he had considered removing the stacked 2x4s. Mr. Conte replied in the affirmative and noted they would be installing a 4x6 header.

Commissioner Danskin asked Mr. Conte if he planned on restoring the south deck. Mr. Conte replied in the affirmative.

Mr. Conte also referenced the photos of the cracked block and said he was filling-in some of the basement window openings to provide stability.

Commissioner Danskin noted that a steel frame would provide support and still accommodate windows. Mr. Conte noted that the basement windows at the west end proposed for removal were in a crawl space and not needed for light.

Commissioner Spann concurred with staff's recommendation.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Brietenfeld, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried. Ayes: O'Boyle, Spann, Brietenfeld, Lee, and Danskin. Noes: None. Abstained: Rea and Taylor. (5-0-2)

3. REVIEW OF 2012-2013 AND 2013-2014 CLG ANNUAL REPORTS

REQUEST: Approval of both reports.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the CLG Annual Reports and requested approval of the 2012-2013 and 2013-2014 reports.

Chairman Rea and staff discussed Page 3 for the 2013-2014 report and when the HPC would review a Section 106 report for a NEPA environmental document.

Chairman Rea asked that the Commission be informed of any Section 106 analyses for historic structures.

Commissioner Danskin asked if the City had policies for the protection of historic elements in the public right-of-way and the repair of sidewalks in the historic district. Mrs. Cherry noted that the Commission had reviewed and provided input regarding the standards for maintaining and replacing historic elements in the public right-of-ways, which were incorporated into the City's Engineering Standards.

Chairman Rea referenced Section VII.B and noted that City Council rescinded application fees in November 2014 after the reporting period, and should be deleted.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve both reports with the correction noted by Chair Rea. Motion carried. Ayes: Rea, Lee, Spann, and Brietenfeld. Noes: None. Abstained: Danskin, Taylor, and O'Boyle. (4-0-3)

4. <u>AD HOC MILLS ACT WORK GROUP REPORT AND REVIEW OF DRAFT BROCHURE:</u>

Chair Rea referenced the checklist, brochure, and the two Mills Act letters from the work group and asked if the commissioners could use the checklist as a tool during visits. Mrs. Cherry replied in the affirmative.

Chair Rea questioned how often visits should occur for Mills Act properties. Mr. Bingham noted he would look into this and report back to the Commission.

Chairman Rea suggested that the brochure be mailed to all Mills Act homeowners so they would not be surprised when they receive a visit letter.

Commissioner Brietenfeld expressed concern with Mills Act letters possibly being sent to renters versus the actual homeowner of the property. Mr. Bingham noted that the Code Enforcement Department would be able to find out who the actual property belonged to and staff would provide the current owners mailing address with the contract's approved list of improvements.

Chair Rea suggested that a post card could be included with the letter requesting a visit that could be used to notify the HPC and staff that they "no longer own the property".

The Commission discussed revisions and inclusions to the brochure.

Chairman Rea asked if the commission was in favor of having the Commission's title at the top of each page. The commission concurred.

Commissioner O'Boyle felt a copy of the Mills Act Contract should accompany the letter. Commissioner Danskin suggested adding language that if they were unaware of the contract to contact City staff.

Commissioner Taylor felt the brochure would greatly benefit new Mills Act homeowners, noting he was not provided this from his real estate agent when he purchased his residence.

Commissioner Spann felt the Secretary of Interior's office was the proper agency to educate the Real Estate Board on the need for real estate agents to be aware of the conditions for Mills Act properties.

Discussion ensued regarding modifying the brochure for real estate agents.

The consensus was for Chair Rea to revise the drafts and provide it to staff and the City Attorney's Office for input.

7. DISCUSSION OF DRIVEWAY POLICIES IN OEN (Taken out of Order)

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, noted that this item came about as a result of staff's recommendation to remove the driveways at the front of the Eller's property at 519 East 9th Avenue in the OEN upon the construction of their proposed garage off the alley at the rear. She noted that the City's code required the removal of the driveway for garage conversions when parking could be provided to an approved parking area somewhere else on site.

Chair Rea felt removal of a driveway should be up to the homeowner, noting there were many situations in the OEN where driveways had been in existence for many years. She noted that leaving the driveway to the original garage would preserve the initial architectural design, particularly for mid-century homes. Mrs.

Cherry noted that removal of the driveway was only required with garage conversions. Chair Rea asked for a copy of the code for garage conversions.

Commissioner Danskin asked what the purpose of removing the driveway was for conversions. Mr. Bingham explained that once a garage was turned into living space, there was no longer a need for a curb cut or driveway approach. With the city dealing with many illegal units and yard parking, the code attempts to curtail opportunities for those abuses, especially in cases where replacement parking is being created off an alley.

Mrs. Cherry noted that the City did not always require that the entire driveway be removed. She stated that the thought behind this policy was to prohibit individuals from parking on their front yard or expanding the parking in the front yard. She also stated that driveways would be allowed to remain for approved second dwelling units.

Commissioner Danskin felt removing the driveway apron would help prohibit front yard parking.

Commissioner Taylor felt forcing someone to remove components of their property was inappropriate. Mrs. Cherry noted that each request was taken on a case-by-case basis.

Chair Rea asked that the historic element be taken into consideration on each request.

Vice-chairman Spann concurred with staff's recommendation.

Commissioner Taylor asked if the intent was to preclude the driveway as a parking area. Mr. Bingham noted that the code had specific language for removing the driveway. Mrs. Cherry noted that the entire driveway did not have to be removed if it could be repurposed.

Vice-chair Spann left the meeting at this time.

Chair Rea suggested the City install curbs if it was concerned with individuals parking in their yards. She also suggested using citations as a deterrent for yard parking.

5. **AD HOC AWARDS WORK GROUP – REPORT/DISCUSSION OF AWARDS AND NOMINATIONS:** Requested by Vice-chair Rea

Commissioner O'Boyle noted that they had identified several adobe structures but did not know if they were in the City. She then asked Ms. Barker if she was aware of a Weir brother's property within the City limits.

Wendy Barker, Escondido, stated she was aware of Weir brothers properties but was unaware of whether they were in the City's boundaries. Chair Rea noted that more investigation was needed to find a Weir brothers adobe house in Escondido. She then suggested awarding a merit award to the Wiers' daughters who lived in Escondido and an Adaptive Reuse Award for Hacienda de Vega.

Ms. Barker noted that the last survey identified some adobe properties.

The consensus of the Commission was to recognize residential and commercial adobe structures.

Discussion ensued regarding having a general presentation on significant adobe properties. Additional discussion ensued regarding recognizing properties outside the City's boundaries.

Commissioner O'Boyle suggested providing awards to the Masonic Lodge and Alhiser-Comer Mortuary. She also felt strongly regarding providing an award to the Sikes adobe.

Commissioner Danskin questioned whether it would be appropriate to give an award to the San Dieguito River Park for their work on the Sikes adobe since it was outside the City. Mrs. Cherry noted she would look into this.

Commissioner O'Boyle motioned to recognize one to three adobe commercial properties, one Weir brothers' property within the City limits, the Sikes adobe and the Donee Diego Drive property. Motion died due to lack of a second.

ACTION:

Moved by Chair Rea, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to present three awards in the categories of commercial adobe (Hacienda de Vega), residential adobe (TBD), and to acknowledge the Weir brothers. The motion also included providing a brief presentation on adobes. Motion carried. Ayes: Lee, Danskin, Rea, and Brietenfeld. Noes: O'Boyle. Abstained: Taylor.

6. <u>PROPOSED WORK GROUP TO STUDY HISTORIC ADOBE DISTRICT FEASIBILITY</u>:

Wendy Barker, Escondido, noted that some of the work for identifying adobe districts had been started in the 2001 historic resource survey, but that the city would not move forward with a district unless the homeowners requested that a district be established.

Commissioner O'Boyle noted that Modern San Diego had identified Weir brother properties.

Mrs. Cherry confirmed that no actions had been taken to establish an adobe district.

Chair Rea asked Commissioner O'Boyle if she was interested in adobes or Weir brother properties. Commissioner O'Boyle stated that she was interested in Weir brother properties.

Mrs. Cherry suggested combining the 2001 resource list and the list from Modern San Diego to see which properties fell within the City's boundaries.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

Mr. Bingham noted that the California Preservation Conference would be held in San Diego this year.

Wendy Barker noted that the City Council would be reviewing the proposed Grape Day Park Master Plan on February 4^{th}.

Chair Rea noted that the Old Escondido Neighborhood would be holding a rummage sale.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS: No comments.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 4:56 pm. The next regular meeting was scheduled for April 7, 2014, at 3:00 p.m.

Rozanne Cherry

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner

Ty Paulson

Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk