

CITY OF ESCONDIDO**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION****June 2, 2015**

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Vice-chair Spann in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Vice-chair Spann, Commissioner Breitenfeld, Commissioner Correll, Commissioner Danskin, Commissioner Lee and Commissioner Taylor.

Commissioners absent: Chair Rea.

Staff present: Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve the minutes of the April 7, 2015 meeting. Motion carried. Ayes: Spann, Taylor, Lee, and Danskin. Noes: None. Abstained: Correll and Breitenfeld. (4-0-2)

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: Received.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: None.

CURRENT BUSINESS:**1. DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 15-0087:**

REQUEST: Kitchen and Master Bedroom and Front Porch Gable Additions and Reconstruction of a dilapidated 1950's OEN residence. Mid-Century style will be changed by the addition of some Craftsman elements.

LOCATION: 520 East 8th Avenue

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner, provided the background history for the property located at 520 East 8th Avenue and showed photos depicting the dilapidated condition of the 1955 residence. The applicants request includes reconstruction of the residence and to add a kitchen and master bedroom, noting that they had found difficulty obtaining a loan because the structure was uninhabitable. Staff presented the reconstruction & addition plans which included adding gables at the front and rear doors and other Craftsman style elements, changing the garage door and replacing the windows with aluminum-clad windows. Staff recommended approval.

Mr. Bingham and the Commission discussed the earlier building dates and styles of the surrounding homes.

Vice-chair Spann stated he had no issues with the subject request, noting his view that the structure did not have a significant historic value.

Commissioner Lee expressed his view that the subject residence was not an essential element to the neighborhood according to the Secretary of Interior Standards.

Commissioner Correll stated that he was in favor of the request but that the type of stone being proposed for the façade should be changed to a type more appropriate to a Craftsman.

Commissioner Danskin stated he had no issues with the subject request, noting his view that the structure did not have significant historic value. He also suggested that not all of the materials and details were appropriate to a Craftsman.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Breitenfeld, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included that the stone material be in line with the Craftsman architecture and that it would be administratively approved by City staff. Motion carried unanimously.

2. DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 12-0094:

REQUEST: To Modify Earlier Conditions of Approval for Addition to Historic House to eliminate the gable windows earlier approved, change some window locations in the proposed addition and place new panes in the existing window frames in the original house.

LOCATION: 1143 Maple Street

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the exhibits and provided a brief history of this previously approved renovation and rear addition project for a 1920's Craftsman. The property is zoned R-3-18 and located within the City's Old Escondido Historic District. Mr. Bingham noted that the applicant's current request was to eliminate the dormers as well as move some other previously approved windows on the rear addition, and place new panes in the existing window frames in the original house, claiming they were beyond repair.

Mr. Bingham said there were some concerns, including whether any window elimination would create egress issues and recommended that the applicant be allowed to work with staff to find appropriate solutions. Staff was recommending the original windows be rehabilitated without pane replacement.

Commissioner Lee stated that his recollection was that the dormers were out of scale to begin with. Mr. Bingham concurred and noted that the applicant was originally conditioned to scale them down. The present request was to completely eliminate them.

Vice-chairman Spann stated that he would be in favor of eliminating the dormers from the design entirely. None had an issue.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve the request to eliminate the dormers from the rear addition. Motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner Danskin clarified that the addition had not been built yet, then stated he had no problem with changes to window locations in the addition. Any window changes in the original structure, however, create problems with patching siding.

Vice-chair Spann wanted to know the reason for wanting to move or eliminate windows in the original structure. Discussion ensued regarding the composition of the existing windows and also the change in siding proposed on the rear addition.

Mr. Bingham said the applicant was asking to use an aluminum-clad wood-framed window product throughout. He then read the Commission's previous action for the subject property as reviewed in 2012.

Vice-chair Spann asked if the applicant was requesting to replace all of the existing windows. Mr. Bingham replied in the affirmative.

Vice-chair Spann stated that retrofit windows create a different look. He was, however, not opposed to allowing a change to the type of window to be used in the addition. Commissioner Danskin concurred, but felt the dimensions of the center rails and sashes of the retrofit windows should match the existing windows. Vice-chair Spann concurred.

Vice-chair Spann reiterated his preference that siding for the existing structure and addition be slightly stepped back as per the Commission's 2012 conditional approval. He believed the replacement windows should all match and be in line with the historic nature of the house. He also stated that he would like to see a better representation of the replacement windows than provided in the present exhibits.

Discussion ensued regarding a clarification of window locations in the structure. Commissioner Breitenfeld stated that her preference would be for the original windows to remain in the original house.

Vice-chair Spann asked if staff could work with the applicant and then administratively approve the windows. Mr. Bingham replied in the affirmative.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve the request to eliminate the windows in the addition, so long as the Building Division had no issues. Motion carried unanimously.

Commissioner Lee expressed his view that the condition of the original windows warranted replacing.

Commissioner Taylor stated that changing out windows is one of the most significant changes that can be made to a house's appearance and style.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Breitenfeld, to direct staff to obtain information regarding the condition of the existing windows and if the existing windows could not be reasonably rehabilitated, an alternate historically appropriate wood-framed retrofit window would be allowed per staff's discretion. Motion carried unanimously.

- 3. EDUCATION PRESENTATION TO COMMISSION ON RECENT CALIFORNIA PRESERVATION FOUNDATIONS THREE-DAY CONFERENCE IN SAN DIEGO:** (This item was continued to August 4th.)

4. AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON MILLS ACT MONITORING

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner, stated that he had some new visit letters for Chair Rea to sign.

5. DISCUSSION OF AD HOC WORK GROUP TOPICS & PARTICIPANTS

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, provided the report and noted that the Ad Hoc Work Group topics were chosen by the Commission, noting that topics could come on and off as needed.

Commissioner Danskin discussed elevating the ability to identify older structures that could be at risk of being lost. Vice-chair Spann felt the Mills Act helped do this.

Discussion ensued regarding establishing a work group to research options for replacement windows.

Discussion ensued regarding identifying midcentury homes, methods for providing information to said homeowners, and updating the guidelines for midcentury homes. Commissioners Breitenfeld, Taylor, and Danskin offered to be members of this work group.

Commissioner Breitenfeld volunteered to be part of the Mills Act Work Group, as did Chair Rea and Vice-chair Spann.

Discussion ensued regarding staff's role in forming historic neighborhood districts.

Item 5 was to remain on future agendas until further directed.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS - None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS - None.

Mrs. Cherry noted that she would be speaking at the West Hillside Neighborhood Group about the historic district process.

Mr. Bingham updated the Commission about the new additions to the Historic Preservation webpage. He then asked if the Commission would be interested in watching an archived California Preservation Foundation webinar about windows that would also count as the required CLG training for the Commission.

The Commission tentatively set a special meeting for July 7, 2015 from 11:30 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. to watch the webinar.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 4:33 pm. The next regular meeting was scheduled for August 4, 2015, with a special meeting being scheduled for July 7, 2015 at 11:30 a.m.



Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner



Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk