

CITY OF ESCONDIDO**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION****October 6, 2015**

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:07 p.m. by Chair Rea in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Chair Rea, Vice-chair Spann, Commissioner Lee, and Commissioner Taylor.

Commissioners absent: Commissioner Brietenfeld, Commissioner Corell, and Commissioner Danskin.

Staff present: Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner; Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve the minutes of the August 4, 2015, meeting. Motion carried unanimously. (4-0)

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: Received.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:**1. MILLS ACT – CASE NO. HP 15-0001:**

REQUEST: Local Register, Mills Act and CEQA Exemption

LOCATION: 447 & 453 East Sixth Avenue

Chair Rea and Commissioner Taylor recused themselves from Item 1.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner, provided the staff report and noted staff recommended forwarding a recommendation of approval to City Council to list

the properties located at 447 and 453 East Sixth Avenue on the Local Register, apply for a Mills Act Contract, and consider the CEQA Exemption.

Discussion ensued regarding clarification of the previous owners of the subject properties.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Vice-chair Spann, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried. Ayes: Spann, and Lee. Abstained: Rea and Taylor. (2-0-2)

2. MILLS ACT – CASE NO. HP 15-0002:

REQUEST: Local Register, Mills Act and CEQA Exemption

LOCATION: 423 South Ivy Street

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner, provided the staff report and noted staff recommended forwarding a recommendation of approval to City Council to list the properties located at 423 South Ivy Street on the Local Register, apply for a Mills Act Contract and consider the CEQA Exemption. He noted that the list would be amended to reflect that the windows would be rehabilitated and that the ornamental wrought iron on the porch would be removed.

Chair Rea concurred with the need for the ornamental wrought iron on the porch being removed.

Vice-chair Spann asked whether the floor on the front porch had been rehabilitated or replaced.

Jesse Hanwit, Applicant, noted that she would have to check and see if the floor on the front porch had been replaced. She noted that the ornamental wrought iron would be removed. She also stated that it was an honor to own a property with historical significance and looked forward to restoring it.

Chair Rea noted that the Pioneer Room would be a great resource for the property, noting that the property had ties with the Turrentine family. She also suggested Ms. Hanwit include her background history.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously.

CURRENT BUSINESS:**1. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. ADM 15-0158:**

REQUEST: Small Addition to rear of Local Register residence.

LOCATION: 210 East Sixth Avenue

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner, provided the staff report and that the request was to add an approximately 100 SF room addition and small loggia extension off the rear of the residence. He noted that all of the materials would match as well as noting that the addition would not be visible from the street. Staff recommended approval.

ACTION:

Moved by Chair Rea, seconded by Vice-chair Spann, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously.

2. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. ADM 15-0160:

REQUEST: Enclosure of a portion of the front porch on an OEN residence.

LOCATION: 637 South Broadway

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner, provided the staff report and noted that this was a Code Enforcement Case due to a portion of the porch being enclosed without permits. Staff was not opposed to enclosing the porch but felt it should be period appropriate by matching the existing siding and windows. He noted that the Commission could rule that the applicant restore it to its original condition or change out the materials to be more period appropriate.

Vice-chair Spann asked when the house was constructed. Mr. Bingham noted that the structure was constructed in the 1930's.



Chair Rea asked if the original window was removed when the porch was enclosed. Mr. Bingham replied in the affirmative.

Vice-chair Spann asked if there was any recourse from the City regarding the subject enclosure. Mr. Bingham noted that the addition would have to meet building requirements.

Vice-chair Spann felt the window should be changed to something period specific and that the materials match the residence.

Chair Rea felt the historical integrity of the structure was lost with the subject addition, feeling it should be restored back to what it was originally.

Chair Rea motioned to require the owner to remove the enclosure and restore it back to its original condition. Motion did not carry due to lack of a second.

Commissioner Lee noted that the subject property was not on the Local Register or Mills Act as well as no research being done regarding the historical significance of the house. He stated that he would prefer to make his decision based on more facts.



Chair Rea felt that each historic residence was part of the fabric of the historic neighborhood.

Mr. Bingham noted that the Commission could require the applicant to conduct research on the home, which could be brought back to the Commission.

Commissioner Taylor suggested requesting the applicant provide a plan that would make the enclosure historically acceptable.

Vice-chair Spann expressed his concern with the addition occurring on a major street and no one noticing it. He also expressed his view that what exists currently was unacceptable, noting his preference would be that the porch be brought back to its original condition. He also stated he could support staff administratively approving the addition with modifications acceptable to staff.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Chair Rea, to require the enclosure be removed and that it be restored back to its original condition. Motion carried unanimously.



3. DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 15-0118:

REQUEST: Driveway and front parking at Local Register / Mills Act OEN residence.

LOCATION: 637 South Juniper Street

Chair Rea and Commissioner Taylor recused themselves from Item 3.

Paul Bingham, Associate Planner, provided the staff report and noted that the request was to construct a driveway and parking off of Juniper Street. He noted that the City's Engineering Department was currently determining whether a driveway would be allowed off of Juniper Street as well as 7th Avenue as an alternative. Staff was looking to the Commission as to whether they would be agreeable to allowing a driveway off of Juniper Street or 7th Avenue.

Commissioner Lee asked if the turn-around would be used for parking. Mr. Bingham noted that it was intended to be a turn-around. He also noted that this would be a condition of the project but enforcing it would be difficult.

Carl Conte, Applicant, noted that when he purchased the property he fell in love with the house and the neighborhood. He stated that he had spent extensive funds in order to be in character with the neighborhood. He indicated that there was no parking on the property and noted that he did not plan on having any vehicles parked in the turn-around.

Vice-chair Spann asked Mr. Conte if he planned on constructing a carport. Mr. Conte replied in the negative. He noted that the traffic on Juniper Street had actually decreased in the last ten years. He also felt decomposed granite would work well and was more historic in nature.

Commissioner Lee was in favor of staff administratively approving either recommendation.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Vice-chair Spann, to approve staff's recommendation to administratively approve a driveway and parking for the property located at 637 South Juniper subject to the Engineering Department's recommendation. Motion carried. Ayes: Lee and Spann. Noes: None. Abstained: Rea and Taylor. (2-0-2)

4. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. ADM15-0161:

RC REQUEST: Addition to rear of OEN residence

LOCATION: 803 East Fifth Avenue

Paul Bingham, Associate Planner, provided the staff report and noted that the request was to add another bedroom and master bathroom totaling 378 SF to the rear of the residence. Staff recommended approval since the addition would not be visible from the street, and the roof, windows, and paint would match what currently exists.

Vice-chair Spann asked if the rooflines would match.

Suzanne Russell, Applicant, stated she did not have this information but noted she would make sure it matched.

Mr. Bingham noted staff could work with the architect to ensure the roofline was appropriate.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included staff administratively approving the architectural design for the roof. Motion carried unanimously.

5. DISCUSSION OF CHANGES PROPOSED TO ARTICLE 65

REQUEST: For Commission to provide comments to Staff

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, provided the report and proposed revisions and requested input.

Vice-chair Spann asked if second dwelling units would require a CUP. Mrs. Cherry replied in the negative.

Vice-chair Spann noted that he supported cleaning-up the inconsistency in the zoning code and streamlining the process within the standards.



Chair Rea felt special attention would be needed when considering second dwelling units in the OEN and suggested that allowing a second dwelling unit separate from the principle residence would be historically appropriate.

6. **STATUS REPORT ON WEST HILLSIDE NEIGHBORHOOD GROUP**

Paul Bingham, Associate Planner, provided the updated and requested input.

7. **AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON UPDATING THE CITY'S HISTORIC GUIDELINES**

Commissioner Taylor resigned from the Historic Guidelines Work Group and Chair Rea was assigned to the work group.

8. **AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON MILLS ACT PROPERTIES**

Chair Rea asked that the Mills Act Information Brochure be included in the Mills Act letters.

Discussion ensued regarding the status of the information packet mailings.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS - None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Vice-chair Spann expressed his concern with his son coming to the City regarding needing to replace a wooden fence and being told at the counter that it would have to go before the Commission. Staff noted they would look into this.

Chair Rea asked if replacing rotted eaves needed a Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative, noting this was a maintenance issue.

Chair Rea expressed her concern with Commission members missing multiple meetings.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 4:43 pm. The next regular meeting was scheduled for December 1, 2015 at 3:00 p.m.


Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner


Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk