

CITY OF ESCONDIDO

ACTION MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

February 25, 2021

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Rea in Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Carol Rea, Chair; Errol Cowan, Vice-Chair; Marc Correll*, Commissioner; James Spann, Commissioner; Marion Hanlon, Commissioner; and Nicole Purvis, Commissioner.

*Note: Only attended part of the meeting due to internet connectivity issues.

Commissioners absent: Carol Breitenfeld, Commissioner.

Staff present: Adam Finestone, City Planner; Julie Procopio, Director of Engineering Services; Jay Paul, Senior Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II; Grant Ruroede, Assistant Planner I; Jessica Relucio, Assistant Planner I; and Joanne Tasher, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner *Correll, with the correction to the November 19, 2020, Minutes that the Vice-Chair is Erroll Cowan, not James Spann; seconded by Vice-Chair Cowan, to approve the action minutes of the November 19, 2020, meeting. Motion carried unanimously (6-0-0; Breitenfeld was absent).

*Note: Just after roll call, Commissioner Correll experienced internet connection issues. He lost connection to the live-stream meeting and was not able to rejoin the meeting.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATION: None.

ORAL COMMUNICATION: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS: None.

CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. DESIGN REVIEW - CASE NO. PL 21-0055:

REQUEST: Grand Avenue Vision Plan - Phase I Historic Preservation Commission guidance in selection of place-making features proposed for the Grand Avenue Vision Plan (Phase I), including ornamental lighting fixtures, fencing and sidewalk treatments

ZONING/LOCATION: Downtown Specific Plan, Downtown Historic District/ Grand Avenue between Maple Street and Broadway

APPLICANT: City of Escondido

STAFF: Julie Procopio, Director of Engineering Services/City Engineer

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Provide direction

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed the three design elements of the Grand Avenue Vision Plan. They discussed each design element- lighting, fencing, and sidewalks separately.

Lighting

The Commissioners raised concerns with the design and style of the proposed lighting, related to both the height of the poles and the style of the lights themselves, and felt that the design is inappropriate for the historic area.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis, seconded by Chair Rea for the applicant to research additional lighting options (single acorn style) that are more in line with the historic feeling of Downtown. Motion passed unanimously (5-0-0; Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

Fencing

There were three styles of fencing presented: Standard Ameristar Fence, "Thicket" and custom cutout.

The "Thicket" style is recommended by the applicant since it is decorative and is reasonably priced.

The Commissioners felt the plain style - Standard Ameristar Fence is more in line with the historic downtown.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis and seconded by Commissioner Cowan to recommend the Standard Ameristar Fence design. Motion passed unanimously (5-0-0; Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

Sidewalks

Two different design/color palettes were presented. The Commissioners debated the color of the sidewalk, "platinum" and beige vs. gray; landscaping, and the idea of adding script or a spiral design laser etched into the concrete.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis and seconded by Vice-Chair Cowan to recommend a single "platinum" color pavement with consistent score lines. Motion passed 5-0-0 (Commissioners Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

No action was taken regarding the type of text, font, or lettering to be etched into the sidewalk. Rather, the Commission directed staff to return with more information on this issue.

2. DESIGN REVIEW - CASE NOS. SUB 19-0010 AND PHG 19-0050:

REQUEST: Hacienda de Vega condo project - Historic design element

ZONING/LOCATION: South Centre City Specific Plan, Southern Entry District
2608 S. Escondido Boulevard

APPLICANT: South Escondido L.P. / (Kitchell Development Co.)

STAFF: Jay Paul, Senior Planner

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed various aspects of the historic design element proposed by the applicant and provided suggestions for what might be a more appropriate design. Amongst other things, the Commission asked the applicant to utilize the adobe bricks from the original Paxton house as part of an entryway into the development.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

The Commission directed the applicant to make revisions to the proposed design element, and to return for consideration at a later date.

3. DESIGN REVIEW- CASE NO. PL 21-0078:

REQUEST: Detached pavilion on a local register property located outside of a historic district

ZONING/LOCATION: RE-20 (Residential Estates, min. lot size 20,000 SF)/ 538
S. Citrus Avenue

APPLICANT: Dennis Ortman

STAFF: Grant Ruroede, Assistant Planner I

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed the project.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann and seconded by Commissioner Purvis, to approve the application as presented by staff. Motion carried unanimously (5-0-0 Commissioners Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

4. DESIGN REVIEW- CASE NO. PL 20-0612:

REQUEST: Room addition on the front of a single-family home in the Old Escondido Neighborhood

ZONING/LOCATION: R-1-6 (Single-family residential, min. lot size 6,000 SF) / 334 E. Ninth Ave.

APPLICANT: Mitch Mitchell, Residential Designs

STAFF: Jessica Relucio, Assistant Planner I

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed various aspects of the project. They expressed dissatisfaction with the proposed modifications, and encouraged the applicant to consider requesting that the house be listed on the local register and potentially be able to enter into a Mills Act contract.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis and seconded by Chair Rea to deny staff recommendation and not approve the proposed project. Motion carried unanimously 5-0-0 (Commissioners Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

5. INFORMATION ITEM - REVIEW OF PREVIOUS AGENDA ITEMS:

REQUEST: None (informational item only)

STAFF: Adam Finestone, Principal Planner

COMMISSION ACTION:

No action taken, discussion only.

6. DISCUSSION-ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW PROCEDURES:

REQUEST: Establish an ad-hoc subcommittee to address environmental review procedures

STAFF: Adam Finestone, City Planner

COMMISSION ACTION:

Chair Rea, Vice-Chair Cowan and Commissioner Purvis volunteered for the committee.

7. DISCUSSION - ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS:

REQUEST: Establish an ad-hoc subcommittee to identify objective design criteria for Accessory Dwelling Units on historic properties

STAFF: Adam Finestone, City Planner

COMMISSION ACTION:

Commissioners Hanlon, Purvis and Spann volunteered for the committee.

8. DISCUSSION -2021 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AWARDS:

REQUEST: Discuss potential themes and/or recipients for 2021 Historic Preservation awards

STAFF: Paul K. Bingham, Assistant Planner II

COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners agreed they will focus this year on Escondido's places of assembly. The list of buildings to select from includes The 1st United Methodist Church of Escondido at 341 S. Kalmia St., The Canvas Church (Old Vintage Church) at 1300 S. Juniper St., The Trinity Episcopal Church at 845 Chestnut St., The First Church of Christ Scientist at 440 S. Broadway, The Point Church (formerly Iglesia Monte de Los Olivos) at 331 W. 4th Ave., and The Escondido Masonic Center (Consuelo Masonic Lodge #325, an adobe) at 1331 S. Escondido Blvd.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The Commissioners will decide the potential recipients at the next HPC meeting on 3/18/21.

ORAL COMMUNICATION: None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Commissioner Purvis happily announced that Chair Rea published a new book!

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 6:09 p.m. to the next regularly scheduled Historic Preservation Commission Meeting on March 18, 2021.

DocuSigned by:

Adam Finestone

30FE4E747B0B44D...

Adam Finestone, Principal Planner

DocuSigned by:

Zack Beck

A58535D0BDC1430...

Zack Beck, City Clerk